



**LEGISLATIVE ASSEMBLY OF MANITOBA**

**VOTES AND PROCEEDINGS No. 63**

**THIRD SESSION, THIRTY-EIGHTH LEGISLATURE**

**PRAYERS**

**1:30 O'CLOCK P.M.**

The following petitions were presented and read:

Mrs. STEFANSON – Legislative Assembly of Manitoba to request the Premier of Manitoba to consider accepting that the funding and delivery of public education is exclusively a provincial responsibility and to consider eliminating the Education Support Levy and Special Levy from all residential property and farmland in Manitoba. (B. Matias, J. Matias, V. Loader)

Mr. LAMOUREUX – Legislative Assembly of Manitoba to request the Legislative Assembly of Manitoba to consider the need to seek clarification on why the Government did not act on fixing the Crocus fund back in 2001. (P. Sarinas, M. Sarinas, C. Catolico and others)

Mrs. MITCHELSON – Legislative Assembly of Manitoba to request that the Minister Responsible for Manitoba Hydro and the Government of Manitoba consider ensuring an informed, appropriate and fair Wuskwatim Project Development Agreement (PDA) Referendum vote, and a vote overseen by an Independent Qualified Third Party such as Elections Manitoba. (H. Moose, I. Moose, K. Moose and others)

Mr. ROCAN – Legislative Assembly of Manitoba to request the Minister of Intergovernmental Affairs and Trade to consider conducting a review of the circumstances outlined and to consider making a recommendation for redress to the Government of Manitoba. (M. Charles, J. Valel, C. T. Daher)

Mr. MAGUIRE – Legislative Assembly of Manitoba to request the Provincial Government to consider funding the PAA to ensure that we receive a reasonable COLA, and that any loss of purchasing power we will face will be minor. (D. Eirikson, F. Waines, M. E. Roach and others)

By leave, Mr. CULLEN for Mr. GOERTZEN – Legislative Assembly of Manitoba to request the Premier of Manitoba to consider covering the cost of insulin pumps that are prescribed by an Endocrinologist or Medical Doctor under the Manitoba Health Insurance Plan. (J. Webster, P. Kroeker, B. Williamson and others)

Ms. BRICK, Chairperson of the Standing Committee on Social and Economic Development, presented its Second Report, which was read as follows:

**Meetings:**

Your Committee met on Monday, June 13, 2005 at 6:30 p.m. in Room 255 of the Legislative Building.

**Matters under Consideration:**

- **Bill (No. 207)** – The Medical Amendment Act/Loi modifiant la Loi médicale

**Committee Membership:**

Substitutions received prior to commencement of meeting:

- Mr. DERKACH for Mr. CUMMINGS
- Mrs. STEFANSON for Mr. ROCAN
- Mr. PENNER for Mrs. ROWAT
- Hon. Mr. SALE for Hon. Mr. LATHLIN
- Mr. JENNISSEN for Hon. Ms. MCGIFFORD
- Ms. KORZENIOWSKI for Hon. Mr. RONDEAU
- Mr. AGLUGUB for Hon. Mr. SMITH
- Mr. DEWAR for Hon. Ms. WOWCHUK

**Public Presentations:**

Your Committee heard eight presentations on **Bill (No. 207)** – The Medical Amendment Act/Loi modifiant la Loi médicale, from the following individuals and organizations:

|                      |  |
|----------------------|--|
| Harry Morstead       | Citizens for Choice in Healthcare          |
| Dr. Darlene Boushard | Manitoba Society of Homeopathic Physicians |
| Dr. Shoshana Scott   | Private Citizen                            |
| Linda West           | Private Citizen                            |
| Ian Breslaw          | Private Citizen                            |
| Nathan Zassman       | Private Citizen                            |
| Perry Kimelman       | Private Citizen                            |
| Helke Ferrie         | The Glasnost Group and Cos Publishing      |

**Written Submissions:**

Your Committee received two written submissions on Bill (No. 207) – The Medical Amendment Act/Loi modifiant la Loi médicale, from the following individuals:

|                         |                 |
|-------------------------|-----------------|
| Florence Matthews       | Private Citizen |
| Father Methodius Kushko | Private Citizen |

**Bills Considered and Reported:**

**Bill (No. 207)** – The Medical Amendment Act/Loi modifiant la Loi médicale

Your Committee agreed to report this Bill, with the following amendment:

*THAT the proposed clause 36.1, as set out in Clause 2 of the Bill, be replaced with the following:*

**Non-traditional therapies**

**36.1** Despite section 36 and Parts VIII to X, a member shall not be found guilty of professional misconduct or of incompetence solely on the basis that the member practises a therapy that is non-traditional or departs from the prevailing medical practice, unless it can be demonstrated that the therapy poses a greater risk to a patient's health or safety than the traditional or prevailing practice.

On motion of Ms. BRICK, the Report of the Committee was received.

\_\_\_\_\_  
Hon. Mr. MACKINTOSH presented:

Annual Report of the Chief Judge of the Provincial Court of Manitoba Concerning Complaints about Judicial Conduct for the year ending December 31, 2003.

(Sessional Paper No. 93)

\_\_\_\_\_  
Hon. Mr. ASHTON, the Minister of Water Stewardship made a statement regarding the operation of the Red River floodway,

Mr. PENNER and, by leave, Hon. Mr. GERRARD commented on the statement.

\_\_\_\_\_  
Pursuant to Rule 26(1), Mr. ROCAN, Mrs. STEFANSON, Hon. Mr. LEMIEUX, Messrs. CALDWELL and CULLEN made Members' Statements.

\_\_\_\_\_  
Mr. DERKACH moved the following Opposition Day Motion:

Whereas the Doer-NDP Government has demonstrated its inability to manage provincial affairs including Health Care, Education, Finance, Agriculture, Family Services and Advanced Education; and

Whereas Manitobans are disillusioned, frustrated and disappointed with this NDP Government because of its duplicitous approach to issues of great importance; and

Whereas Manitobans are being misled by this NDP Government when announcements on programs are made but action plans are either not developed or not implemented; and

**Tuesday, June 14, 2005**

---

Whereas Manitobans are left in pain, and prolonged suffering, because of the ideology of this NDP Government which prohibits patient treatment in publicly funded, privately run health care facilities; and

Whereas the Premier continues to be duplicitous in his statements about issues of utmost importance to Manitobans, especially with Health Care and the use of public-private partnerships; and

Whereas hospitals in rural Manitoba have been and are closing despite the Premier's promises on many occasions that no rural hospital would be closed or converted; and

Whereas the South Beach Casino will soon be open, exposing workers and patrons to a smoke-filled environment which compromises their health and well-being; and

Whereas the incompetence of the Minister of Education has allowed the gross misuse of tax payers dollars allocated for educational purposes, to be used instead for the unlawful purpose of a housing development and property development; and

Whereas the Minister of Education abdicates responsibility for the continued misuse of taxpayer dollars by refusing to put an immediate stop to the illegal development of land by a school division; and

Whereas the Minister of Education has failed to show leadership with respect to duties, programs, initiatives and funds within the purview of the Department of Education; and

Whereas the NDP Government has failed to oversee and monitor Labour Sponsored Capital Investment Funds (Crocus) resulting in the loss of millions of investor and taxpayer dollars; and

Whereas the Doer-NDP Government with its anti-business approach to investment in Manitoba has failed to grow, expand and diversify Manitoba's economy; and

Whereas in a year of unprecedented government revenues the NDP Government is forcing Manitobans to pay significantly higher fees for many services, including probate fees paid by surviving spouses and children, Pharmacare deductibles and family court fees; and

Whereas Manitoba's debt, under the watch of the NDP government continues to rise at \$1.5 million per day, and cumulatively has risen by two billion dollars during a time when Manitoba has seen unparalleled federal transfers and own source revenues; and

Whereas it has been more than two years since the outbreak of BSE, which has put Manitoba's cattle industry in great jeopardy and this NDP Government has failed to expand slaughter and processing capacities in Manitoba; and

Whereas the Minister of Family Services has shown disrespect for the Legislative process of accountability and members of this chamber by refusing to answer serious questions as they relate to the policies of the Department of Family Services and Housing; and

Whereas Manitoba Universities are being forced to raise student ancillary fees because of the insufficient operating funds transferred from this NDP Government to our post-secondary institutions; and

Whereas the NDP Government has now forced an anti-democratic Master Labour Agreement on Manitobans by forcing non-unionized workers on the Floodway Expansion Project to pay union dues, pension and benefit costs, when these costs are already covered under existing agreements with their respective employers.

THEREFORE BE IT RESOLVED that this Legislature express its disgust and disappointment on behalf of Manitobans in the way in which this NDP Government has conducted the affairs of the Province of Manitoba; and

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED that the Legislative Assembly express its grave objection to the Premier and NDP Government for misleading Manitobans, mishandling major issues and government departments and for misusing and misspending Manitobans' hard earned tax dollars; and

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED that the Legislative Assembly of Manitoba respectfully request the Premier and NDP Government to apologize to Manitobans for the careless, insensitive and duplicitous manner in which it has carried out its duties on behalf of the citizens of Manitoba.

And a debate arising,

And Mr. DERKACH, Hon. Mr. BJORNSON, Messrs. MURRAY, CALDWELL, PENNER, JHA, ROCAN, NEVAKSHONOFF, CULLEN, SWAN, CUMMINGS and AGLUGUB, Mrs. TAILLIEU and Hon. Mr. ASHTON having spoken,

And the Question being put. It was negatived, on the following division:

**YEA**

|           |                 |
|-----------|-----------------|
| CULLEN    | LOEWEN          |
| CUMMINGS  | MAGUIRE         |
| DERKACH   | MITCHELSON      |
| DRIEDGER  | MURRAY          |
| DYCK      | PENNER          |
| EICHLER   | REIMER          |
| FAURSCHOU | ROCAN           |
| GERRARD   | SCHULER         |
| GOERTZEN  | STEFANSON       |
| HAWRANIK  | TAILLIEU.....21 |
| LAMOUREUX |                 |

NAY

|              |                 |
|--------------|-----------------|
| AGLUGUB      | MARTINDALE      |
| ALLAN        | MCGIFFORD       |
| ALTEMEYER    | NEVAKSHONOFF    |
| ASHTON       | OSWALD          |
| BJORNSON     | REID            |
| BRICK        | ROBINSON        |
| CALDWELL     | RONDEAU         |
| CHOMIAK      | SALE            |
| DEWAR        | SANTOS          |
| IRVIN-ROSS   | SCHELLENBERG    |
| JENNISSEN    | SELINGER        |
| JHA          | SMITH           |
| KORZENIOWSKI | STRUTHERS       |
| LEMIEUX      | SWAN            |
| MACKINTOSH   | WOWCHUK..... 31 |
| MALOWAY      |                 |

---

By unanimous consent, it was agreed for Orders of the Day to take place at 1:30 p.m. followed by Routine Proceedings at 2:30 p.m. for Wednesday, June 15, 2005 and Thursday, June 16, 2005.

---

The House then adjourned at 5:17 p.m. until 1:30 p.m. Wednesday, June 15, 2005.

Hon. George HICKES,  
Speaker.